

The impacts of international labour migration on indigenous productivities in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Dr. Sami Ullah	Department of Sociology, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Dir Upper, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan
Dr. Sameer Ul Khaliq Jan	Department of Social Work, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Dir Upper, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan. sameer@sbbu.edu.pk
Dr. Amir Alam	Department of Social Work, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Dir Upper, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan
Miss. Tasleem	Department of Sociology, Shaheed Benazir Bhutto University, Sheringal, Dir Upper, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan

Abstract: *The international labour migration bears significant positive impacts for the individual, family and national level but it often have some hidden negative repercussions for the country of origin. The study aims to identify the impacts of international labour migration on the indigenous productivities. The study was conducted in three union council of distract Upper Dir tehsil Sheringal, Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, Pakistan, such as Sheringal, Doag dara and Guwaldi. The data was collected from 345 household by using survey questioner and analyzed with descriptive and inferential statistics. It was found that international labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production, reducing local livestock management, declining traditional medicinal plants production and decreasing the productions of indigenous fisheries. The huge dependencies on foreign remittances limits the participation of indigenous people in wood industries and handicraft productions. It was suggested that the proper uses of remittances should be insure in indigenous productivities to boost up the socio-economic and cultural preservation.*

Keywords: International labour migration, indigenous productivities

Introduction

The cross boarder movement of people for searching employments opportunities as a worldwide phenomenon causing by many factors such as economic inequalities, labor market demands, and the expansion of globalization (Castles, Haas and Miller, 2013). Migration often highlighted positive consequences for home countries, such as improvement of livelihood opportunities by sending remittances (Connell and Conway, 2000). While migration also creates some hidden problem for society particularly the effecting indigenous productivities, which needs to be critical examination.

The indigenous productivities is a distinctive economic, traditional and cultural assets, which maintain the local economy and feed local communities (World Bank, 2022). These are consisting of agro-based production, livestock managements and participation of small scale industries.

Declining indigenous productivities due to international labour migration occurs in many ways such as the shortage of labours, decreasing traditional knowledge and eliminating cultural economies. Similarly, the indigenous cultural transformation to the younger generation is important for sustaining traditional practice, which is diminish as younger generation prioritize overseas migration (Connell and Conway, 2000). This pattern of migration creates vulnerability of the indigenous economies, which causing

socio-economic and cultural repercussions.

The connections between international migration and indigenous productivities is a critiques, how to sustain the traditional economies and resilience the heritage of culture in the era of globalization. This research highlights the dynamic impacts of international labor migration on the indigenous productivities.

The study was based on World system theory, which was developed by Immanuel Wallerstein (1974) and stated that the international labour migration is due to the global economic inequality and the expansion of capitalism. The economically rich “Core” countries in the world perpetuating capitalism to poor “periphery” countries to expend their markets and to extract resources, which disturbing the traditional employment of the local people (O’reilly, 2022). Different channels were established for these disperse population to migrate to the core countries to run the industries of capitalism (Bakewell, 2014). These migrations altered the poor periphery countries by economic dependency (Mahmood et al., 2019), brain drain (Ahmed et al., 2022), decline in agricultural productivity (Gazdar, 2018) and underdevelopment of indigenous industries (Wallerstein, 1979). The periphery countries also facing capital flow and consumerism, urbanization and resource redistribution (Siddiqui & Abrar, 2020) labor export and global Exploitation (ILO, 2021).

A seminal work by Carrington and Detragiache (1999) emphasizes the economic repercussions of brain drain, arguing that the departure of skilled professionals can lead to a decline in a country's productivity and innovation, negatively affecting overall economic growth. Docquier and Rapoport's comprehensive analysis (2012) explores the impact of brain drain on the education sector, noting that the emigration of educators and researchers can result in a scarcity of qualified personnel, subsequently diminishing the quality of education and research.

Clemens and Pettersson's study (2008) delves into the consequences of health worker migration, revealing how brain drain contributes to shortages in the healthcare sector, particularly in developing nations, thus affecting the accessibility and quality of healthcare services.

Teixeira and Aliyev (2018) discuss the impact of brain drain on research and innovation, highlighting how the departure of researchers and scientists impedes a country's ability to engage in cutting-edge research, collaborations, and the development of a robust research ecosystem.

Saxenian's work (2002) adds a sociocultural perspective, illustrating how brain drain can result in the loss of social capital and a disconnection from the cultural fabric of sending countries, potentially leading to a sense of detachment.

The study by Docquier, Lowell, and Marfouk (2009) takes a gendered approach, highlighting the differential effects of brain drain on men and women. It explores how migration patterns impact the gender composition of skilled professionals in sending countries.

Bhagwati and Hamada's foundational work (1974) and more recent research by Docquier et al. (2018) delve into policy responses aimed at mitigating brain drain's negative effects. These include strategies like skill retention initiatives, investment in education, and creating an environment conducive to return migration.

In conclusion, this literature review synthesizes a range of studies highlighting the multifaceted negative effects of brain drain on sending countries, encompassing economic, educational, healthcare, and sociocultural dimensions. The collective insights from these works underscore the need for nuanced policy responses to address the challenges posed by brain drain while considering the diverse impacts on various sectors within sending nations.

Methodology

The nature of the study was quantitative research design, which follow positivist research paradigm.

The study was conducted in district Upper Dir tehsil Sheringal, more specifically three union council were selected such as Sheringal, Doag dara and Guwaldi. The absence of accurate information about the migrants therefore, the researchers conducted a pilot survey in which they found 3409 household, in which at least one individual were found as a labour migrant. The household were identify by using snowballing sampling techniques. A sample size of 345 household were selected as per the analogy of Sekaran (2003). The sample size were further distributed according to proportional allocation formula (Chuodry and Kamal, 2006).

Each sample respondents were informed before the conduction of social survey by taking proper consent. Social survey was conducted in respective home and working site. Therefore, self-administered questioner were design which cover all the variables used in study objectives.

Table 1 Conceptual framework

Independent Variables	Dependents Variable
The impacts of international labour migration	Indigenous productivities

In first stage, the data was analyzed through frequency and percentage distribution by using SPSS version 21. In the second stage, the date were analyzed through chi-square test to show the association between dependents and independents variables, by using the following formula.

$$\chi^2 = \sum_{i=1}^r \sum_{j=1}^c \frac{(O_{ij} - e_{ij})^2}{e_{ij}}$$

Similarly, the Odds Ratio analysis was used to identify the strength of an association by using the following formula.
$$\text{Odds Ratio} = \frac{PG_1 / (1 - PG_1)}{PG_2 / (1 - PG_2)}$$

The data ware presented by tabulation. Each table show the responses in percentage distribution and chi-square and odds ratio calculations.

Results at univariate analysis

Table 2 indicated about the impacts of international labour migration on the indigenous productivities. The table show that (86.3 %) of the respondents agreed that international labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production, while 13.6 % of the respondents disagreed with the statement.

Similarly, (84.6 %) of the respondents were agreed that international labour migration reducing local livestock production, while the remaining 15.3 % of the respondents disagreed with the statement.

Similarly, (81.1 %) of the respondents agreed, that international labour migration declining traditional medicinal plants production and only 18.8 % of the respondents rejected the statement.

Likewise, (84.4 %) of the respondents were agreed that international labour migration decreasing the indigenous fisheries productions while 15.6 % of the respondents refused the statement.

The table further indicated that, (85.2 %) of the respondents approved, that international labour migration limits the participation in wood production, although 14.7 % of the respondents disapproved that statement.

Moreover (85.3 %) of the respondents accepted that increasing dependency on remittances reducing the participation in handicraft productions though, 14.7 % of the respondents disagreed with the statement.

Table 2. The impacts of International labour migration

The impacts of International labour migration	Yes	No	Total
International labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production.	298 (86.3)	47 (13.6)	345 (100)
International labour migration reducing local livestock production.	292 (84.6)	53 (15.3)	345 (100)
International labour migration declining traditional medicinal plants production.	280 (81.1)	65 (18.8)	345 (100)
International labour migration decreasing the indigenous fisheries productions.	290 (84.0)	55 (16.0)	345 (100)
International labour migration limits the participation in Wood production.	293 (84.9)	52 (15.1)	345 (100)
Increasing dependency on remittances reducing the participation in handicraft productions.	294 (85.3)	51 (14.7)	345 (100)

Results at bivariate analysis association between the impacts of international labour migration on indigenous productivities.

The table 3 indicated the statistics of chi-square and odds ratio analysis which the association and the strength and direction of an association between the impacts of international labour migration on indigenous productivities. The table show that, there is a strong association between international labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production ($P = 0.001$). The Odds ratio ($OR=6.234$) show that, the international labour migrants minimizing almost 6 time indigenous crops production then those who did not migrated.

Similarly, chi-square explored that international labour migration reducing local livestock production ($P = 0.000$) which show strong association, while the odds ratio ($OR= 7.453$) indicated that international labour migrants reducing almost 7 time local livestock production then non-migrants.

Likewise, chi-square ($P = 0.002$) showing significate association between the international labour migration and declining traditional medicinal plants production. The odds ratio ($OR= 8.764$) reflected that international labour migrants declining almost 8 time traditional medicinal plants production then non-migrants people.

Moreover, chi-square statistics ($P = 0.000$) explain significant association between the international labour migration and decreasing the indigenous fisheries productions. The odds ratio ($OR= 7.345$) indicated that the international labour migrants decreasing almost 7 time indigenous fisheries productions then those people who did not migrated.

Furthermore, the chi-square value ($P = 0.003$) indicated a significant association between the international labour migration and declining the participation people in wood industries. The odds ratio calculation ($OR= 5.234$) show that the international labour migration declining 5 time people participation in wood industries, then non-migrants.

The table further indicated that there is a strong association ($P = 0.004$) between increasing dependency on remittances and reducing the participation of people in handicraft productions. The odds ratio ($OR= 9.234$) indicated that increasing dependency on remittances reducing almost 9 time the participation of people in handicraft productions, then those people who did not dependencies on foreign remittances.

Table 3 Association between the impacts of international labour migration on indigenous productivities.

The impacts of International labour migration and indigenous productivities	Statistics
International labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production.	(x) = 11.056 P = 0.001 OR=6.234
International labour migration reducing local livestock production.	(x) = 09.034 P = 0.000 OR= 7.453
International labour migration declining traditional medicinal plants production.	(x) = 12.345 P = 0.002 OR= 8.764
International labour migration decreasing the indigenous fisheries productions.	(x) = 10.043 P = 0.000 OR= 7.345
International labour migration limits the participation in Wood production.	(x) = 13.059 P = 0.003 OR= 5.234
Increasing dependency on remittances reducing the participation in handicraft productions.	(x) = 14.066 P = 0.004 OR= 9.234

Discussion

The result indicate that there the international migration bear negative impacts on the indigenous productivities (*see Table 2 and Table 3*). The result show that international labour migration declining the local crops, livestock, fisheries and medicinal plants productions. The increasing dependencies on foreign remittances and the shortage of skilled people decreasing the people participation in local crops production, livestock management, fisheries and medicinal plants productions. A study conducted by (Tiffen, 2004) in West Africa also stated that population pressure and urbanization negatively affect the local crops and livestock production.

Mostly people left for international labour migration, which negative affect the participation of people in wood industries. Wood industry is very remarkable in rural areas of Pakistan, which is the source of income for the majority of the rural people, such as making furniture and cooking utensils. There is lessor participation of people in wood industries when people are migrated abroad. (Stalker, 2000) also supported the similar results which show the negative impacts of globalization and people participation in wood industries.

The result also show that when increasing dependencies on foreign remittances, which negatively affect the participation in handicraft productions. Handicraft production is often associated with rural women. When household income is depend upon the foreign remittances, therefore women showing less participation in homebased productivities as outline by (Tullao, and Cabuay, 2016).

5.2. Conclusion

It was concluded from the result that the international labour migration brought negative consequences on the indigenous productivities. The study precisely supported world system theory that migration is perpetuated by the expansion of capitalism. Migration is due to the unequal distribution of global wealth. The wealthy core country continuously try to expand their markets and industries to periphery and semi periphery countries, which extract the resources and disturb the traditional employments in poor countries. It the result majority of people become unemployed and compel them for migration to core countries, because different channels were open for their migration (O'reilly, 2022).

Therefore, the study show that international labour migration minimizing the indigenous crops production, reducing local livestock production and declining traditional medicinal plants production in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa Pakistan. , decreasing the indigenous fisheries productions. The huge

dependencies on foreign remittances limits the participation of indigenous people in wood industries and handicraft productions. Future researches should focus on how to manage foreign remittances to boost up local productions.

REFERENCES

- Ahmed, S., et al. (2022). The Brain Drain Phenomenon: Implications for Pakistan's Economy. *Journal of Migration Studies*.
- Alba, R., & Nee, V. (1997). Rethinking assimilation theory for a new era of immigration. *International Migration Review*, 31(4), 826-874.
- Anderson, B., & Ruhs, M. (2010). Engaging the 'Employability Gap': Employer Recruitment Strategies and Migrant Worker Vulnerability in Contemporary Labour Markets. *Oxford Development Studies*, 38(4), 423-441.
- Bakewell, O. (2014). Relaunching migration systems. *Migration Studies*, 2(3), 300-318.
- Bernard, A., & Gebauer, J. E. (2008). Does culture create social value? The case of immigrant employment success. *Journal of Business Research*, 61(10), 1090-1098.
- Bhagwati, J., & Hamada, K. (1974). The brain drain, international integration of markets for professionals and unemployment: A theoretical analysis. *Journal of Development Economics*, 1(1), 19-42.
- Carrington, W. J., & Detragiache, E. (1999). How big is the brain drain? IMF Working Paper, 99(4), 1-18.
- Castles, S., de Haas, H., & Miller, M. J. (2013). *The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World* (5th ed.). Palgrave Macmillan.
- Chuang, J. (2006). Beyond a Snapshot: Preventing Human Trafficking in the Global Economy. *Indiana Journal of Global Legal Studies*, 13(1), 137-165.
- Clemens, M. A., & Pettersson, G. (2008). New data on African health professionals abroad. *Human Resources for Health*, 6(1), 1-11.
- Connell, J., & Conway, D. (2000). Migration and remittances in island microstates: A comparative perspective on the South Pacific and the Caribbean. *International Journal of Urban and Regional Research*, 24(1), 52-78.
- Crock, M., Saul, B., & Dastyari, A. (2006). *Future Seekers: Refugees and the Law in Australia*. Federation Press.
- Docquier, F., & Rapoport, H. (2012). Globalization, brain drain, and development. *Journal of Economic Literature*, 50(3), 681-730.
- Docquier, F., Lowell, B. L., & Marfouk, A. (2009). A gendered assessment of the brain drain. *Population and Development Review*, 35(2), 297-321.
- Docquier, F., Lowell, B. L., & Marfouk, A. (2009). A gendered assessment of the brain drain. *Population and Development Review*, 35(2), 297-321.
- Dustmann, C., & Frattini, T. (2014). The fiscal effects of immigration to the UK. *The Economic Journal*, 124(580), F593-F643.
- Essed, P., & Nimako, K. (2006). Migrant women in the Dutch labor market: Beyond the negative impact of migrant women as domestic workers. *Gender & Development*, 14(2), 227-239.
- Gazdar, H. (2018). Agricultural Labor and Migration Patterns in Rural Pakistan. *Development Economics Journal*.

- International Labour Organization (ILO). (2021). *The Impact of COVID-19 on Labor Migration: Global Trends*.
- Mahmood, A., et al. (2019). Remittances and Economic Development in Pakistan. *Economic Review of South Asia*.
- Massey, D. S., Arango, J., Hugo, G., Kouaouci, A., Pellegrino, A., & Taylor, J. E. (1998). *Worlds in motion: Understanding international migration at the end of the millennium*. Oxford University Press.
- O'reilly, K. (2022). Migration theories: A critical overview. *Routledge handbook of immigration and refugee studies*, 3-12.
- Penninx, R., & Garcés-Mascareñas, B. (2016). Integration processes and policies in Europe: Contexts, levels, and actors. Springer.
- Piller, I., & Takahashi, K. (2006). A passion for English: Desire and the language market. *Multilingual Matters*.
- Piper, N. (2015). Paying for Protection: The New Migrant Landscapes of Exploitation. *Antipode*, 47(1), 133-151.
- Portes, A. (1998). Social Capital: Its Origins and Applications in Modern Sociology. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 24, 1-24.
- Portes, A., & Rumbaut, R. G. (2001). *Legacies: The story of the immigrant second generation*. University of California Press.
- Pratt, G. (2007). Dangerous Liaisons? Critical Feminist Perspectives on the Trafficking–Migration–‘Sex Work’ Nexus. *Gender and Development*, 15(3), 349-364.
- Rousseau, C., Drapeau, A., & Corin, E. (2008). Risk and Protective Factors for the Well-being of Immigrant Children: Results from the Canadian National Longitudinal Survey of Children and Youth. *Social Psychiatry and Psychiatric Epidemiology*, 43(11), 918-927.
- Saxenian, A. L. (2002). *Brain circulation: How high-skill immigration makes everyone better off*. Brookings Institution Press.
- Siddiqui, T., & Abrar, C. R. (2020). *Migration and Urbanization in South Asia*. Routledge.
- Stalker, P. (2000). *Workers without frontiers: the impact of globalization on international migration*. International Labour Organization.
- Teixeira, R., & Aliyev, K. (2018). The brain drain and the macroeconomic effects of the research and development expenditures. *Technological Forecasting and Social Change*, 126, 271-280.
- Tiffen, M. (2004). Population pressure, migration and urbanisation: Impacts on crop-livestock. In *Sustainable Crop-Livestock Production for Improved Livelihoods and Natural Resource Management in West Africa: Proceedings of an International Conference Held at the International Institute of Tropical Agriculture (IITA) Ibadan, Nigeria, 19-22 November 2001* (p. 3). ILRI (aka ILCA and ILRAD).
- Tullao, T. S., & Cabuay, C. (2016). International migration and remittances: A review of economic impacts, issues, and challenges from the sending country's perspective. *Entrepreneurship and trade*, 76-103.
- Wallerstein, I. (1974). *The Modern World-System I: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World-Economy in the Sixteenth Century*.
- White, K., Haas, J. S., & Williams, D. R. (2012). Elucidating the role of place in health care disparities:

The example of racial/ethnic residential segregation. *Health Services Research*, 47(3 Pt 2), 1278-1299.

World Bank. (2021). *Migration and Remittances: Recent Developments and Outlook*.

World Bank. (2022). *Migration and Development Brief 36: Recovery and Resilience in a Globalized Economy*. Washington, DC: World Bank.